

Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus in healthcare settings

Jaffar A. Al-Tawfig^{a,b} and Trish M. Perl^c

Purpose of review

Attracting global attention, Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) continues to cause sporadic cases and a potential risk of healthcare-associated infections. In this review, we highlight what is known about the risk of transmission within healthcare facilities and discuss interventions to halt its transmission within healthcare.

Recent findings

MERS-CoV causes a wide range of infections from asymptomatic infections, mild or moderately symptomatic cases, to fatal disease. Two years after the initial reported case, MERS-CoV has caused limited disease outside the Arabian Peninsula with several cases in Europe, Asia, and the United States. Epidemiologically, these infections are linked to exposures from the region and their diagnosis outside is related to travel. Several reported clusters of disease report multiple transmissions of MERS-CoV within healthcare settings that have been attributed to poor compliance with the basic infection control measures. Factors contributing to the spread and control of MERS-CoV within healthcare settings have not been elucidated so far. Data suggest the overcrowding, late recognition of MERS-CoV cases, and inadequate infection control practices contribute significantly to the transmission.

Summary

Understanding factors contributing to the spread and the dynamic of MERS-CoV transmission within healthcare settings would further enhance the control of the disease in and outside the healthcare setting.

Keywords

coronavirus, healthcare facilities, Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus, prevention, transmission

INTRODUCTION

There are six human Corona viruses (hCoV) known to cause human respiratory tract infections. These include HCoV-229E, HCoV-OC43, HCoV-NL63, HCoV-HKU1, Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus, and the Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) [1,2]. In 2012, MERS-CoV was identified from a patient who was admitted with progressive pneumonia in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia [3]. Since then, a total of 952 cases have been reported with a case fatality rate of 43.4% [4]. The clinical presentation and the epidemiology of the disease were reviewed recently [5**,6**,7-10]. Importantly, MERS-CoV was described among healthcare workers and in healthcare settings leading to amplified transmission [11**-13**,14*,15]. In this review, we discuss available data regarding healthcare transmission of MERS-CoV and summarize known risk factors and key measures for the control of the disease within healthcare settings.

Transmission of Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus within the healthcare facility

Since the initial description of MERS-CoV infection, the virus has caused outbreaks within healthcare facilities [11**-13**,14*,15], yet there remains a paucity of data to guide policy in many arenas. Since the initial description of the disease in June 2012 until 14 March 2015, a total of 952 MERS cases were reported in Saudi Arabia alone [4]. Of the total

^aJohns Hopkins Aramco Healthcare, Dhahran, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, ^bIndiana University School of Medicine, Indianapolis, Indiana and ^cDivision of Infectious Diseases, Department of Medicine, Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland, USA

Correspondence to Jaffar A. Al-Tawfiq, PO Box 76, Room A-428-2, Building 61, Dhahran Health Center, Saudi Aramco, Dhahran 31311, Saudi Arabia. Tel: +966 13 877 3524; fax: +966 13 877 3790; e-mail: jaffar.tawfiq@aramco.com; jaltawfi@yahoo.com

Curr Opin Infect Dis 2015, 28:392-396

DOI:10.1097/QCO.000000000000178

KEY POINTS

- Factors contributing to the spread and control of MERS-CoV within healthcare settings have been poorly elucidated.
- Multiple transmissions of MERS-CoV within healthcare settings are attributed to poor compliance with the basic infection control measures.
- Proper infection control application would prevent the transmission of MERS-CoV within healthcare settings.

748 cases reported as of September 2014, approximately 27% were healthcare workers [16]. The transmissibility of the virus in healthcare settings depends on the case finding and the infection control measures in place. Hence, there are gaps in our knowledge. For example, transmission within the healthcare setting was recognized retrospectively in the outbreak described in Jordan [14,15], later such transmission was documented among almost one-third of cases in the Al-Hasa outbreak [11^{••}] and in Jeddah, Saudi Arabia [12**,13**]. Two of 13 people (including 10 healthcare workers) were confirmed to have MERS CoV infection using rRT-PCR in the Jordanian outbreak in Zarqah [14*]. Based on the serologic studies, an attack rate of 10% was reported among exposed healthcare workers and 5% of family contacts [15]. Other studies have, however, not demonstrated transmission among healthcare providers including those reported from the United Kingdom, France, and Saudi Arabia [5",17–19]. A group of healthcare workers from a single hospital of whom 48 had and 48 did not have contact with a MERS-CoV case revealed that MERS-CoV was not detected in any of those contacts by serologic testing [19]. A summary of the studies evaluating transmission of MERS-CoV among patients, healthcare workers, and others is shown in Table 1 [13^{••},14[•],15-20,21[•],22[•],23,24].

Factors contributing to inter- and intrahospital transmission of Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus

Several factors may contribute to the reported interand intrahospital transmission. First, similar to other respiratory tract infections, initial symptoms of MERS-CoV are not specific hampering the initial identification of these patients. Furthermore, the period of communicability of MERS-CoV, the duration of viral shedding, or characteristics that enhance viral shedding have not been defined. Although healthcare workers are advised to practice standard and droplet precautions when dealing with

any patient with an acute respiratory infection [25], compliance with respiratory etiquette and infection control practices remain a challenge. A study of 48 healthcare workers found that upper respiratory symptoms developed in 27% of those who cared for MERS-CoV positive cases compared with 33% of those who did not have contact with MERS-CoV patients [19]. Of the 48 with case-contact, 87.5% reported wearing a medical mask, and 33% reported wearing an N-95 mask [19]. Because individual healthcare workers may report wearing both forms of respiratory protection, the total percentage is more than 100% [19]. The study did not address the difference between those who had symptoms and those who did not have symptoms.

Still, in other healthcare settings, MERS-CoV transmission is described among healthcare workers and patients. In the 2013 Al-Hasa outbreak, 21 of 23 infections were considered healthcare acquired and associated with intrahospital transfer and likely inadequate infection control [11**]. Of more than 200 exposed healthcare workers, only two laboratory-confirmed cases were identified among them [11**]. Of note, this outbreak spanned over four hospitals and occurred early in the time line of the disease. Importantly, this outbreak occurred before the full spectrum of illness was appreciated and a search for healthcare workers in contact with cases was actively done [19]. The most recent outbreak in Jeddah (February-April 2014) involved 128 MERS-CoV patients in 14 hospitals, in which the infection was amplified in the healthcare setting [12**,13**]. Subsequently, 109 of 112 (97.3%) of symptomatic nonhealthcare workers were thought not to be primary cases [13**]. In another setting, transmission of MERS-CoV was reported between two immunosuppressed patients in the United Kingdom, yet the exposures were not described [26].

In an attempt to define the risk of acquisition of MERS-CoV in various settings and more systematically, investigators in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia reviewed data from over 2908 cases and found that 72 (2.5%) were considered related to nosocomial transmission [20]. To determine how commonly MERS-CoV was transmitted in among healthcare workers, they used nasopharyngeal swabs to screen 1695 healthcare workers who were in contact with cases between 1 October 2012 and 30 September 2013 [20]. Only 19 (1.1%) of these healthcare workers had evidence of MERS-CoV by PCR [20]. This attack rate is lower than that reported among family contacts of 3.6% (17 out of 462 of contacts) [20]. One study of 70 cases found a higher rate of transmission between 2012 and 2014 with eight (11%) healthcare-associated MERS-CoV infections [27] with the largest cluster being in the emergency

Table 1. Healthcare associated MERS-CoV outbreaks and clusters

Reference	Total number of cases/contacts	Number of HCWs (% of the total cases)	Respiratory symptoms (%)	N (%) MERS positive HCW	Method of testing	Fatality	Country
14	191 symptomatic cases	81(42.4)	40 (21)	40 of 81 tested (50%)	PCR	Ϋ́Z	KSA
14	64 asymptomatic cases	₹Z	(0) 0	41 (64)	PCR	₹Z	KSA
15	124 contacts	89 (71)	(0) 0	6 (6.7)	Serology or PCR	Two of nine cases (22%)	Jordan
16	Two laboratory-confirmed and 11 probable cases	10 HCWs suspected	13 (100)	Two laboratory-confirmed	Serology	₹ Z	Jordan
17 (June 2012 to 18 September 2014)	748 cases	∢ Z	PCR	202 (27)	PCR	۲×	KSA
18	64 contacts	56 (87.5)	13 (23)	0 of ted (0)	Serology	0	X
19	123 contacts	110 (89.4)	₹Z	(0) 0	PCR	0	France
20	48 contacts	48 (100)	0	(0) 0	EIA	0	KSA
21	5065 contacts	1695 contacts (33)	(0) 0	19 (1.12)	PCR	0	KSA
22	520 contacts	4 (7.6)	4 (100)	4 (14)	PCR	0	KSA
23	AN	7		7 (100)	PCR	ĄZ	KSA
24	255 cases	65 (25.5)	₹Z	39 (30.4)	PCR	Ϋ́Z	KSA
24	37 cases		٨	25 (67)	PCR	ĄZ	UAE
25 (19 September 2014 to 24 March 2015)	200 cases	80 (40)	∀ Z		PCR	∀ Z	KSA

EIA, enzyme immunoassay; HCWs, healthcare workers; KSA, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia; MERS-CoV, Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus; NA, not available; PCR, polymerase chain reaction; UAE, United Arab Emirates; UK, United Kingdom.

department [27]. More recent studies have identified that the majority of healthcare workers who developed MERS-CoV infection were younger women, and were asymptomatic or mildly symptomatic [23]. Severe disease was described in 15% of healthcare workers and led to hospitalization, ICU admission, or death [23]. Most of the affected healthcare workers were nurses indicating the importance of prolonged, repeated, and close physical contact with MERS-CoV patients [15].

Proportion of healthcare-associated infection among Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus cases

According to the WHO MERS-CoV Research Group, of 95 MERS-CoV cases 63.2% were healthcare associated and 13.7% were family contacts [28]. In a study of 70 cases from one hospital, at least 50% of the cases were acquired in the hospital setting [27]. In the 2014 Jeddah outbreak, there were 128 laboratory-confirmed cases in 14 hospitals between 17 February and 26 April 2014 [13**,23,29]. Of these cases, 33% were primary cases and more than 60% (including 39 healthcare workers) were acquired within healthcare facilities [23].

Factors contributing to intrahospital transmission

Data are limited about the specific factors accounting for the transmission within healthcare facilities. Overcrowding, close proximity of patients to cases, delay in isolation of cases as in the Al-Hasa outbreak, and the use of aerosol generating and high-risk procedures were, however, thought to contribute to the transmission [11**]. Possible factors contributing to healthcare transmissions of MERS-CoV may include the following: super-spreader cases who shed virus extensively, prolonged viral shedding, and suboptimal infection control measures.

'Super-spreader' of Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus

Super spreaders are individuals who spread disease to multiple individuals. The number of secondary transmissions of MERS-CoV from a single case is variable; however, in one study, one patient transmitted MERS-CoV infection to 10 other patients [27]. In the Al-Hasa outbreak, one patient with MERS-CoV transmitted the infection to seven other individuals [11**]. No further analysis of the frequency of transmission was delineated to characterize the frequency of the occurrence of secondary and tertiary transmission.

Prolonged viral shedding

Prolonged viral shedding of patients and asymptomatic contacts is reported and poses potential important challenges for infection control [30]. MERS-CoV in two patients was detected for prolonged periods, up to 18 and 24 days, from the respiratory tract secretions using rRT-PCR [31,32]. Importantly, studies have identified MERS-CoV by rRT-PCR in asymptomatic family contacts, and healthcare workers [20]. In fact, MERS-CoV was detected in 30% of 'case' contacts 12 days after exposure [33]. During the 2014 Jeddah outbreak, an asymptomatic healthcare worker was shedding MERS-CoV for almost 6 weeks; from 24 April 2014 to 12 June 2014 [34].

Controlling nosocomial transmission

The tenets of controlling transmission of respiratory viruses are well demonstrated with MERS-CoV infections. Public health authorities have provided varying recommendations regarding MERS-CoV infection control practices in healthcare settings. The WHO advocates contact and droplet precautions and the use of airborne isolation precautions during aerosol generating procedures. Whereas the United States and the European Centers for Disease Control and Prevention advocate the use of airborne isolation precautions for all patients in all settings [35–37]. All public health authorities advocate for aggressive surveillance to identify potential cases with the use of isolation when a case is suspected.

Application of infection control measures

Basic infection prevention is important and includes the use of standard precautions and compliance with hand hygiene. Interhospital and intrahospital transmission of MERS-CoV infection is a risk and as found in the Al-Hasa outbreak could be aborted by early recognition of cases and the universal use of standard and droplet precautions when in contact with patients with respiratory symptoms [11**,27]. Airborne isolation should be specifically used in those patients requiring aerosol-generating procedures [36,37]. It is of paramount importance that patients be cohorted to avoid cross transmission between patients. Furthermore, healthcare workers may be a source of transmission. Asymptomatic healthcare workers shed MERS-CoV and could infect susceptible patients and coworkers should be evaluated carefully. Ideally, they should be furloughed until they are no longer shedding MERS-CoV as indicated by negative MERS-CoV tests. Repeated MERS-CoV testing is indicated every 3 days after initial positive screen until documentation of at least two negative tests.

CONCLUSION

MERS-CoV is the newest of the respiratory viruses to emerge and be characterized by transmission in healthcare settings. Yet, the transmission of MERS-CoV within a healthcare facility remains poorly studied and an important issue to understand to implement control. While transmission has been documented in multiple outbreaks, the overall risk of transmission appears low. Infection control recommendations are based on knowledge from Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome and other corona viruses and include standard precautions and droplet or airborne precautions. Further systematic collections of data in relation to outbreak control measures and factors leading to outbreak are needed to refine policies and procedures to combat the disease.

Acknowledgements

None.

Financial support and sposorship

None.

Conflicts of interest

There are no conflicts of interest.

REFERENCES AND RECOMMENDED READING

Papers of particular interest, published within the annual period of review, have been highlighted as:

- of special interest
- of outstanding interest
- de Groot RJ, Baker SC, Baric R, et al. Family coronaviridae. In: King AMQ, Lefkowitz E, Adams MJ, Carstens EB, editors. Ninth report of the International Committee on Taxonomy of Viruses. Oxford: Elsevier; 2011. pp. 806–828.
- Al-Tawfiq JA, Zumla A, Memish ZA. Coronaviruses: severe acute respiratory syndrome coronavirus and Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus in travelers. Curr Opin Infect Dis 2014; 27:411–417.
- Zaki AM, van Boheemen S, Bestebroer TM, et al. Isolation of a novel coronavirus from a man with pneumonia in Saudi Arabia. N Engl J Med 2012; 367:1814-1820.
- Saudi Ministry of Health. Center for Control and Command. http://www.moh. gov.sa/en/CCC/PressReleases/Pages/default.aspx. [Accessed 25 March 2015]
- Al-Tawfiq JA, Memish ZA. An update on Middle East respiratory syndrome: 2
 years later. Expert Rev Respir Med 2015; 1–9. [Epub ahead of print]
 Most recent update of MERS-CoV.
- 6. Memish ZA, Al-Tawfiq JA. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus infection control: the missing piece? Am J Infect Control 2014; 42:1258−1260. Infection control issues in MERS-CoV.
- Al-Tawfiq JA, Memish ZA. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus: epidemiology and disease control measures. Infect Drug Resist 2014; 7:281–287.
- Al-Tawfiq JA, Memish ZA. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus: transmission and phylogenetic evolution. Trends Microbiol 2014; 22:573–
- Al-Tawfiq JA, Zumla A, Memish ZA. Travel implications of emerging coronaviruses: SARS and MERS-CoV. Travel Med Infect Dis 2014; 12:422-428.
- Memish ZA, Assiri A, Alhakeem R, et al. Middle East respiratory syndrome corona virus, MERS-CoV. Conclusions from the 2nd Scientific Advisory Board Meeting of the WHO Collaborating Center for Mass Gathering Medicine, Riyadh. Int J Infect Dis 2014; 24:51–53.
- Assiri A1, McGeer A, Perl TM, et al. Hospital outbreak of Middle East
 respiratory syndrome coronavirus. N Engl J Med 2013; 369:407−416.
 Comprehensive Al-Hasa MERS-CoV outbreak investigation.
- Drosten C, Muth D, Corman VM, et al. An observational, laboratory-based study of outbreaks of Middle East respiratory syndrome corona virus in Jeddah and Riyadh, Kingdom of Saudi Arabia, 2014. Clin Infect Dis 2015; 60:369−377.
 Jeddah MERS-CoV outbreak laboratory investigation.

- 13. Oboho IK, Tomczyk SM, Al-Asmari AM, et al. 2014 MERS-CoV outbreak in Jeddah: a link to healthcare facilities. N Engl J Med 2015; 372:846−854. Jeddah MERS-CoV outbreak investigation.
- 14. Al-Abdallat MM, Payne DC, Alqasrawi S, et al. Hospital-associated outbreak
 of Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus: a serologic, epidemiologic,
 and clinical description. Clin Infect Dis 2014; 59:1225 1233.
- An initial study of a cluster of MERS-CoV in Zarqa, Jordan.
- Hijawi B, Abdallat M, Sayaydeh A, et al. Novel coronavirus infections in Jordan, April 2012: epidemiological findings from a retrospective investigation. East Mediterr Health J 2013; 19 (Suppl 1):S12-S18.
- Saudi Ministry of Health. Ministry of health updates historical MERS-CoV infection data. Available at: http://www.moh.gov.sa/en/CCC/PressReleases/ Pages/Statistics-2014-09-18-002.aspx. [Accessed 15 March 2015]
- Pebody RG, Chand MA, Thomas HL, et al. The United Kingdom public health response to an imported laboratory-confirmed case of a novel coronavirus in September. Euro Surveill 2012; 17:20292.
- 18. Mailles A, Blanckaert K, Chaud P, et al. First cases of Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) infections in France, investigations and implications for the prevention of human-to-human transmission, France, May 2013. Euro Surveill 2013; 18:20502.
- Hall AJ, Tokras JI, Badreddine SA, et al. Healthcare worker contact with MERS patient, Saudi Arabia. Emerg Infect Dis 2014; 20:2148–2151.
- Memish ZA, Al-Tawfiq JA, Makhdoom HQ, et al. Screening for Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus infection in hospital patients and their healthcare worker and family contacts: a prospective descriptive study. Clin Microbiol Infect 2014; 20:469–474.
- 21. Arabi YM, Arifi AA, Balkhy HH, et al. Clinical course and outcomes of critically ill patients with Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus infection. Ann Intern Med 2014; 160:389-397.
- Outcome of critically ill MERS-CoV patients.
- Memish ZA, Zumla AI, Assiri A. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus infections in healthcare workers. N Engl J Med 2013; 369:884–886.

Description of MERS-CoV among healthcare workers.

- World Health Organization. Middle East Respiratory Syndrome Coronavirus (MERS-CoV) summary and literature update as of 9 May 2014. Available from: http://www.who.int/csr/disease/coronavirus_infections/MERS_CoV_ Update_09_May_2014.pdf?ua 1/4 1. [Accessed 15 March 2015]
- Saudi Ministry of Health. Available at: http://www.moh.gov.sa/en/CCC/ PressReleases/Pages/default.aspx. [Accessed 25 March 2015]
- World Health Organization. Available at: http://www.who.int/csr/don/2december-2014-mers/en/. [Accessed 10 March 2015]
- Guery B, Poissy J, el Mansouf L, et al. Clinical features and viral diagnosis of two cases of infection with Middle East Respiratory Syndrome coronavirus: a report of nosocomial transmission. Lancet 2013; 381:2265–2272.
- 27. Saad M, Omrani AS, Baig K, et al. Clinical aspects and outcomes of 70 patients with Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus infection: a single-center experience in Saudi Arabia. Int J Infect Dis 2014; 29:301–306.
- The WHO MERS-CoV Research Group. State of knowledge and data gaps of Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERSCoV) in humans. PLoS Curr 2013 Nov 12;5. pii:ecurrents.outbreaks.0bf719e352e7478f8ad85fa30127ddb8
- WHO. Global Alert and Response (GAR). Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) – update http://www.who.int/csr/don/2014_05_ 28_mers/en/. [Accessed 15 March 2015]
- **30.** Drosten C, Meyer B, Müller MA, *et al.* Transmission of MERS-coronavirus in household contacts. N Engl J Med 2014; 371:828-835.
- Drosten C, Seilmaier M, Corman VM, et al. Clinical features and virological analysis of a case of Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus infection. Lancet Infect Dis 2013; 13:745-751.
- Spanakis N, Tsiodras S, Haagmans BL, et al. Virological and serological analysis of a recent Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus infection case on a triple combination antiviral regimen. Int J Antimicrob Agents 2014; 44:528-532.
- Memish ZA, Assiri AM, Al-Tawfiq JA. Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV) viral shedding in the respiratory tract: an observational analysis with infection control implications. Int J Infect Dis 2014; 29:307-308.
- 34. Al-Gethamy M, Corman VM, Hussain R, et al. A case of long-term excretion and subclinical infection with Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus in a healthcare worker. Clin Infect Dis 2015; 60:973–974.
- 35. World Health Organization. Infection prevention and control during healthcare for probable or confirmed cases of novel coronavirus (nCoV) infection. Available at: http://www.who.int/csr/disease/coronavirus_infections/IPCn-CoVguidance_06May13.pdf?ua=1. [Accessed 20 March 2015]
- 36. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Middle East respiratory syndrome (MERS). Interim infection prevention and control recommendations for hospitalized patients with Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV). Available at: http://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/mers/infection-prevention-control.html. [Accessed 20 March 2015]
- 37. European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control. Epidemiological update Middle East respiratory syndrome coronavirus (MERS-CoV). Available from: http://www.ecdc.europa.eu/en/press/news/_layouts/forms/News_DispForm. aspx?List 1/4 8db7286c-fe2d-476c-9133-18ff4cb1b568&ID 1/4 998. [Accessed 25 February 2015]